



INNOVATIVE: Journal Of Social Science Research

Volume 4 Nomor 3 Tahun 2024 Page 371-382

E-ISSN 2807-4238 and P-ISSN 2807-4246

Website: <https://j-innovative.org/index.php/Innovative>

Factorization of the Difficulty of Political Parties in Indonesia to Develop as an Implementation of Democratic State

Firstnandiar Glica Aini Suniaprily^{1✉}, Muhammad Aziz Zaelani², Yulian Dwi Nurwanti³, Adhy
Nugraha⁴

Universitas Islam Batik Surakarta

Email: firstnandiar@gmail.com^{1✉}

Abstrak

Pemilihan umum yang diselenggarakan untuk memilih anggota lembaga perwakilan rakyat, yang mencakup kegiatan partai politik, merupakan bentuk demokrasi. Dalam hal ini, sebuah negara yang mematuhi sistem demokratis adalah negara yang diatur berdasarkan keinginan dan kehendak rakyat. Penelitian ini menggunakan metode penelitian yuridis normatif dengan pendekatan penelitian perpustakaan untuk mengumpulkan data sekunder. Pendekatan perpustakaan adalah pendekatan yang bertujuan untuk memperoleh data yang dilakukan melalui proses membaca, menulis, kemudian diproses dengan berbagai sumber literatur, buku, catatan, majalah, untuk memperoleh jawaban atas masalah hukum yang sedang diteliti. Dalam kenyataannya, banyak perilaku partai politik yang tidak sejalan dengan ideologi yang telah ditetapkan. Sistem Rekrutmen dan Pola Kader Anggota Partai Politik saat ini cukup mengkhawatirkan. Banyak fenomena telah menimbulkan keraguan tentang kader partai politik. Dalam hal ini, masalah utamanya adalah bahwa ketergantungan partai politik pada dana dari pemerintah telah mengubah sifat partai politik itu sendiri. Berdasarkan hasil kontemplasi, dapat disimpulkan bahwa ada tiga masalah yang terjadi dalam partai politik di Indonesia, yaitu: 1) Pelemahan ideologi partai politik, 2) Pelemahan Tingkat Kualitas Administrasi dan Pola Rekrutmen Kader Anggota Partai Politik, 3) Krisis dalam mengumpulkan dana partai politik yang dalam dana pemerintah telah mengubah sifat partai politik itu sendiri.

Kata Kunci: *Demokrasi, Faktorisasi, Partai Politik*

Abstract

General elections held to elect members of the people's representative institutions, which include the activities of political parties, are a form of democracy. In this case, a country that adheres to a democratic system is a country that is organized based on the will and will of the people. This research uses a normative juridical research method with a library research approach to collect secondary data. The library approach is an approach that aims to obtain data carried out through the process of reading, writing, then processed with various sources of literature, books, notes, magazines, in order to obtain answers to the legal problems being studied. In reality, many political party behaviors are not in line with the established ideology. The Recruitment System and Cadre Pattern of Political Party Members at this time are quite alarming. Many phenomena have raised doubts about political party cadres. In this case, the main problem is that the dependence of political parties on funds from the government has changed the nature of the political parties themselves. Based on the results of contemplation, it can be concluded that there are three problems that occur in political parties in Indonesia, namely: 1) The weakening of political party ideology, 2) Weakening of the Quality Level of Administration and Recruitment of Cadre Patterns of Political Party Members, 3) Crisis in collecting political party funds which in government funds has changed the nature of the political party itself.

Keywords: *Democracy, Factorization, Political Parties*

INTRODUCTION

The Modern countries in the world generally declare themselves as countries with a democratic system, namely a system that makes people's sovereignty the main source. The concept of sovereignty in the establishment of a state will always be attached to the state concerned. Sovereignty is a very important element in a country. This makes the state an organization of power that functions as a tool to achieve common goals (Thaib, 1999).

In a democratic country, the relationship between the state and its people can be described as a relationship that has symbiotic mutualism. This means that the relationship between the state and its people must be mutually beneficial to each other. This relationship will be clear when the political system used by a democratic country can provide sufficient space and openness for political activities in the community (Basuki, 2020). This space for political activity will give color to democratic life in a country. The principles of democracy and popular sovereignty provide the will for the participation of the people in constitutional life. The people or citizens are not only objects but also subjects who play an important role in constitutional life (Basuki, 2020).

The existence of representative institutions is something that must be fulfilled in a democratic and sovereign state. According to modern democracy, political parties, elections

and representative institutions are three things that cannot be separated from one another. This understanding states that every political party will always try to gain large popular support during general elections so that the political party concerned can dominate the representative institutions.

Democracy is a social and political framework of a society based on the principles of freedom and equality. This is because democracy itself is based on the philosophy that humans are free and equal beings. Humans are free beings, in the sense that humans are not created as robots whose sources of activity are determined by forces from outside themselves. General elections held to elect members of the people's representative institutions, which contain the activities of political parties, are a form of democracy (Basuki, 2020).

The earliest stages of various series of democratic constitutional life can be realized in a general election. The general election can also be a driving force for the mechanism of the political system in a democratic country. With general elections, the filling of state bodies or organs can begin, both state organs tasked with exercising popular sovereignty, as well as state organs tasked with carrying out the wheels of government.

As we know, democracy, which is used as the basis for living in society and the state, means that it is the people who provide an assessment of state policies because these policies will affect people's lives. In this case, a state that adheres to a democratic system is a state that is organized based on the will and will of the people. The organization of the state must also have the consent of the people because sovereignty is in the hands of the people (Azra, 2003). Democracy is a system that is used as an alternative in various activities of society and state in several countries. As Mahfud MD said, there are at least two reasons why democracy is adopted as a system of society and state. First, democracy has been used as a fundamental principle in almost all countries in the world. Second, democracy has essentially provided direction for the role of society to organize the state as its highest organization. Here, democracy is used as the principle of statehood (Moh, 1993).

The democratic system as a manifestation of people's sovereignty must ensure that the people can be fully involved in planning, regulating, implementing, monitoring and evaluating the implementation of power functions (Asshiddiqie, 2006). The purpose of the establishment of a political party is an attempt to seize or maintain pre-existing power in the government to carry out policies that have been determined by each political party. A political party is essentially a group consisting of members who have been organized regularly both regarding views, goals, and membership recruitment procedures. In this case,

the main purpose of the political party is to seize or maintain pre-existing power in the government (Saleh, 2018).

In a democratic country, people have the right to be able to choose which political party to join. Political parties have their own ideologies and rules in implementing their party policies. Both in the internal scope of the party, as well as in the external scope of government and society. Usually, people will tend to choose or follow a political party whose party ideology is in accordance with themselves. In order to gain public support, political parties will present their programs as well and attractively as possible. This is what makes people confident and interested in making their choices for the political party (Saleh, 2018).

According to the opinion of Miriam Budiardjo, a political party is an organized group whose members have the same orientation, values and ideals. The group's goal is to gain political power and seize political positions, namely by constitutional means to implement its program. Carl J. Friedrich also believes that a political party is a group of people organized in a stable manner who have the aim of seizing or maintaining control of the government for their party leaders, where this control can provide fair and material benefits to all party members (Budiardjo, 2008).

By looking at the current conditions of state life, a political party can be a forum for actualization for a group or individuals who want to be directly involved in the political dynamics in government. Political parties have actually become a major spotlight in society, especially on the existence of party members or cadres involved in government (Ristyawati, 2019). The implementation of political party programs and policies in the context of community service is an inseparable part of the process of political parties in the midst of community life (Rais, 1986).

By using an institutional approach, political parties are seen as institutions that have structures and functions to achieve certain goals. Institutional theory explains that political parties are formed by state institutions, both legislative and executive, as a need for their members to establish contact and foster support from the community (Mawazi, 2017). The political system in Indonesia has positioned political parties as the main pillars of organizing democracy in Indonesia, meaning that democracy in Indonesia will not work without political parties (Artis, 2012). The formation of political parties is a reflection of the rights of citizens to associate, assemble, and express opinions in accordance with Article 28 of the 1945 Constitution. In this regard, the state does not limit the number of political parties formed by the people as long as the political parties formed do not conflict with the objectives to be achieved as stipulated in Article 1 of Law No.31 of 2002 concerning Political Parties. Each

political party may have different goals, according to the vision and mission of the party, but these goals must not deviate from the laws and regulations (Arianto, 2004). Based on this explanation, the following problems can be formulated: (a) How problematic are political parties in Indonesia within the framework of a democratic state?.

RESEARCH METHOD

Explaining The Materials and Methods on this research uses a normative juridical research method with a library research approach to collect secondary data. The library approach is an approach that aims to obtain data carried out through the process of reading, writing, then processed with various sources of literature, books, notes, magazines, in order to obtain answers to the legal problems being studied. In addition to using a library approach (library research) the author also uses a statutory approach, namely an approach that is carried out by examining all laws and regulations related to the case or legal issue to be studied. In the statutory approach method, it is necessary to understand the hierarchy of laws and regulations and the principles in laws and regulations. This data collection technique is carried out by reading, studying, and making notes from books, as well as writings related to the problem that is the object of research (Adlini et al., 2022).

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Factorization of the Difficulty of Political Parties to Develop in Indonesia

Political parties are a means of implementing politics implemented by countries that adhere to a democratic system. Political parties began to emerge and develop since the late 18th century in Western European countries. Political parties function primarily as a forum for representation of the voice and desires of the community. Indonesia strives to realize national goals that embody the ideals of democracy and respect for the voice of the people. Democracy itself means that the people hold the highest power. It is the voice of the people that should be heard. However, what is currently happening is that political party officials and participants in the elections seem to ignore the concept of democracy that was built in Indonesia (Maharani & Tampubolon, 2023). Political parties have always been an arena of struggle between groups that are ambitious to compete for power within the party. Therefore, conflicts over power always color every party's social life and become a major component in the process of running a political party (Andriyanto, 2023).

The definition of a political party is contained in article 1 number 1 of Law Number 2 of 2011 concerning amendments to Law Number 2 of 2008 concerning political parties which

reads "A political party is an organization that is national in nature and is formed by a group of Indonesian citizens voluntarily on the basis of a common will and ideals to fight for and defend the integrity of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia based on Pancasila and the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia". Political parties as a means of absorbing, collecting, and channeling the political aspirations of the community in formulating and determining state policies. often political parties act loudly for and on behalf of the interests of the people, but in reality in the field they fight for the interests of their own administrators or are oligarchic, this is due to the problematic of party democratization (Toloh, 2023).

The journey of political parties in Indonesia has undergone many changes, especially after the reformation. The most striking change in the problem of political parties is the ideology of political parties, where ideology should be used as the basis and purpose of the establishment of political parties as pawns of democracy, but instead now the ideology of political parties has shifted to seek profit alone. This shifting political party ideology has a negative meaning because it creates the concept that interests are more important than political life itself (Yishai, 2001). Political parties that have an ideology that interests above all have characteristics, among others, ideology and political party programs are not used as the main goal and are defeated for the purpose of interests that benefit political party members who are loaded with economic values (Labolo & Ilham, 2015). The problem of political parties that occurs in Indonesia in addition to ideological shifts is the existence of cartel politics, which is politics where parties and their activities no longer carry the interests of constituents or the public interest, but take care of themselves and politics becomes a profession in itself (Ambardi, 2009). Problems of political parties that occur in Indonesia include:

a. The Weakening of Political Party Ideology

The word ideology contains two meanings, namely ideology functionally and structurally. Functionally, it can be interpreted as a set of ideas about the common good, or about society and the state that is considered the best. While structurally, ideology can be interpreted as a system of justification, such as ideas and political formulas for every policy and action taken by the ruler (Surbakti, Supriyanto & Susanto, 2008). With a clear ideology in each political party, the identity of each party will also be clear so that people can easily determine which political party is in accordance with their ideology. The criteria that we can know to determine the weakness of political party ideology is seen from the behavior and

character of political parties. Which can be known through the Ideology of Political Parties based on the Articles of Association (AD)/Bylaws (ART) of the Party, the AD / ART document is a formal statement of a political party that contains ideological statements, abstract principles, main party goals, and a series of specific programs (Sugiono & Mas'udi, 2009).

Sometimes the ideology that is formally written in the AD / ART does not reflect the ideology of the party. In reality, many political party behaviors are not in line with the ideology that has been determined. To determine the ideology of a political party is not easy, this is because many parties do not purely display their party ideology as they have determined. Then the behavior of political party elites when facing elections. One example is the phenomenon of party coalitions at the central level that differ in ideology, which in turn causes problems. Indonesia is a democracy that promotes human rights, freedom, pluralism, and equality that puts the majority and minority on the same stage (Ginanjari, 2024).

There are many differences of opinion within the coalition that make the government ineffective. In fact, coalitions should ideally be formed on the basis of ideological similarities so that when the coalition is in power there will not be many disputes caused so that the government can run effectively. If the formation of a coalition does not take into account the similarity of ideology, it will have an impact on the difficulty of making policies because there are very sharp differences of opinion among the coalition parties.

b. Weak Level of Quality of Administration and Recruitment Patterns of Cadre of Political Party Members

The Recruitment System and Cadre Pattern of Political Party Members are currently quite alarming. Many phenomena have raised doubts about political party cadres. If the recruitment system and cadre regeneration patterns are carried out properly by each political party, there will never be a phenomenon of betrayal from the original political party. The phenomenon of naturalization of political party cadres from one party to another that occurs at this time shows that political parties experience dysfunction in political recruitment and regeneration patterns and are considered to have failed in instilling party ideology to their cadres.

A political party is an organization that is national in nature and formed by a group of Indonesian citizens voluntarily on the basis of a common will and ideals to fight for and defend the political interests of members, the political interests of the community, the political interests of the nation and state, and maintain the integrity of the Unitary State of

the Republic of Indonesia based on Pancasila and the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia (Utama, 2023).

Dysfunction is defined as the non-functioning of political parties normally or their functions are disrupted. This is because political parties do not implement the functions of political parties as stated in Article 11 number 1 letter a which reads "Political parties function as a means of political education for members and the wider community to become Indonesian citizens who are aware of their rights and obligations in the life of society, nation and state". Cases that occur in the recruitment process of political party members who only recruit to meet quotas without any political education and orientation that causes regeneration and regeneration in political parties are not optimal.

In general, political parties are the key to the success of a country's political system, and the most important key is the recruitment of cadres and political party administrators, which is an important indicator to see the changes and development of a political party in building a political system in a country's government. But in practice, the process of recruiting cadres and party administrators still violates many of the rules as regulated in Law Number 2 of 2011 concerning political parties (Areza, Akbar, Ikhsan & Nasution, 2023).

This has caused political parties to experience dysfunction in the form of internal divisions because their members are not loyal because from the beginning their regeneration is not maximized and without being equipped with political education and a series of orientation activities. The increasingly instant recruitment and regeneration system adds to the negative assessment of the community towards political parties. Political parties are more likely to recruit ready-made cadres, not cadres who are truly raised and feel the process of party life from a bitter period to a period of achieving the party's goals, resulting in recruitment patterns and cadre patterns of political party members who lack loyalty and quality. Political parties are a major component of a democratic system and have the task of articulating the public will, conducting political education, developing and offering policy alternatives and providing political choices to the public in elections (Juniar, 2021).

Many politicians also tend to utilize the big name of their new party to win elections when the old party fails to deliver itself as a winner. This reflects that the process carried out by politicians to obtain political positions is no longer oriented towards the public interest, but tends to be used to fulfill personal or group interests. This phenomenon can cause processes such as coaching, preparation and selection of political cadres to not run properly. The political parties that have emerged in Indonesia have diverse characteristics. It depends on individual numbers and has no clear socio-economic basis. For political parties, the

process of cadre formation is a struggle. As some political parties do not have a clear executive system, oligarchic recruitment often occurs (Wijayanti & Iswandi, 2021).

c. Political Party Fundraising Crisis

The availability of a large and smooth source of funds for a political party is a non-negotiable necessity. Recruited by political parties and make the political party that if a party experiences a crisis in terms of funding (Sugiharto, 2021), it is possible for the party to do all kinds of ways including by mortgaging the party's ideology so that it turns into a pragmatic party or a party that legalizes various methods. As we know, Article 34 of Law No. 2/2011 on Political Parties states that the source of political party funds comes from dues of political party members, lawful donations, and assistance from the APBN / APBD.

In accordance with Government Regulation No. 5/2009 on Financial Support to Political Parties, the government is obliged to provide financial support to political parties. However, problems arise when the financial support received is too little to meet the needs of the party, so political parties must seek funds to meet party needs, especially through private donations. Therefore, political parties tend to pay attention to the interests of their donors, making them unrealistic in fighting for the interests of the people (Dimas Adytia, 2020). It needs to be realized, for political parties when approaching the general election, more and more funds are spent to get victory in the election, this is certainly a note that needs to be taken into account by a political party regarding the funds owned by the party.

Moreover, if contributions from party members are very minimal, then parties tend to depend on the State Budget (APBN) and Regional Budget (APBD) where these funds become the main income of the party. Donations of funds from the APBN / APBD are given based on the proportion of the number of votes of political parties in the acquisition of seats in the DPR RI, Provincial DPRD and Regency / City DPRD. The donation is given with the aim of providing political party education to political party members and the community, which in reality in the field, political party education is not implemented, of course this is very unfortunate. Although the party's bylaws have outlined various party programs that support the achievement of food sovereignty (Mayrudin, Nurrohman & Maharani, 2022). Increasing state funding for political parties is a policy step that requires special attention regarding accountability and justification (Susanto & Michael, 2023).

What is even more concerning is the phenomenon of political parties utilizing their cadres who have strategic positions in political positions to raise funds illegally, making it seem legal. It cannot be denied that there are institutions or state business entities that are

used as cash cows. The phenomenon that occurs is a reality that can certainly make a bad image for political parties and certainly threatens state finances. The high need of political parties for financial income has encouraged the emergence of a new type of party, namely cartel parties (Ambardi, 2009). The cartel party emerged as a result of the inability of parties to maintain their funding sources, which came from membership fees or the community that became their social base. In this case, the main problem is that the dependence of political parties on funds from the government has changed the nature of the political parties themselves. Political parties seem to move away from society and get closer to the state or government.

CONCLUSION

Provide Based on the results of the discussion, it can be concluded that there are three problems that occur in political parties in Indonesia, namely: 1) The weakening of political party ideology, whereas when viewed from the behavior and character of political parties, it can be understood through the ideology of political parties based on the AD / ART of political parties and the behavior of political party elites when conducting elections. 2) Weak Level of Quality of Administration and Recruitment of Cadre Patterns of Political Party Members, where political parties tend to prefer to recruit ready-made cadres rather than mature cadres, and feel the process of party life from difficult years to the realization of the goals of the political party itself, so that it even produces loyalty to cadre patterns and regeneration of low-quality political party members. 3) The crisis of political party fundraising, which is on government funds, has changed the nature of the political party itself. Political parties seem to be away from the community and close to the state or government in power. Efforts that must be made to strengthen political parties as a form of institutionalization of democracy are, 1) The ideology of political parties must be strengthened, 2) Improve the quality and strengthen the system and pattern of selection and appointment of members and cadres of political parties, 3) Strengthen the development of a political party financing system with information transparency.

REFERENCES

- Adlini, M. N., Dinda, A. H., Yulinda, S., Chotimah, O., & Merliyana, S. J. (2022). Metode Penelitian Kualitatif Studi Pustaka. *Edumaspul: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 6(1), 974–980.
- Adytia, P. D. (2020). *Bantuan Keuangan Partai Politik Dari Anggaran Pendapatan Dan Belanja Negara Sebagai Sumber Utama Pendanaan Partai Politik*. Doctoral

- dissertation, Universitas Andalas.
- Ambardi, K. (2009). *Mengungkap politik kartel*. Kepustakaan Populer Gramedia.
- Andriyanto, A. (2023). Penyelesaian Perselisihan Internal Partai Politik Menurut Undang-Undang Nomor 2 Tahun 2011 Tentang Partai Politik Yang Mempunyai Kekuatan Mengikat Dan Diterima Oleh Para Pihak. *JIM: Jurnal Ilmiah Mahasiswa Pendidikan Sejarah*, 8(3), 1922–1937.
- Areza, T. S. M., Akbar, F., Ikhsan, E., & Nasution, M. (2023). Demokratisasi Dalam Proses Rekrutmen Kepengurusan Partai Politik Di Indonesia. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial dan Pendidikan*, 7(2), 1276–1286.
- Arianto, H. (2004). Peranan Partai Politik dalam Demokrasi di Indonesia. *Lex Journalica*, 1(2), 17940.
- Artis, A. (2012). Eksistensi Partai Politik dan Pemilu Langsung dalam Konteks Demokrasi di Indonesia. *Sosial Budaya*, 9(1), 59–80.
- Asshiddiqie, J. (2006). *Konstitusi dan konstitusionalisme*. Sekretariat Jenderal dan Kepaniteraan Mahkamah Konstitusi RI.
- Azra, A. (2003). *Demokrasi, hak asasi manusia dan masyarakat madani*. Tim ICCE UIN.
- Basuki, U. (2020). Parpol, Pemilu dan Demokrasi: Dinamika Partai Politik dalam Sistem Pemilihan Umum di Indonesia Perspektif Demokrasi. *Kosmik Hukum*, 20(2), 81–94.
- Budiarjo, M. (2008). *Dasar-Dasar Ilmu Politik*. PT. Gramedia.
- Ginjar, H. (2024). Dinamika Politik Identitas di Indonesia: Permasalahan, Peluang, dan Jalan ke Depan. *AL-BAHTS: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial, Politik, dan Hukum*, 2(1), 1–7.
- Juniar, A. (2021). Redesain demokrasi internal partai politik: Upaya mencegah oligarki dan korupsi partai politik. *Jurnal Politikom Indonesiana*, 6(1), 17–39.
- Labolo, M., & Ilham, T. (2015). *Partai politik dan sistem pemilihan umum di Indonesia*. Rajawali Pers.
- Maharani, R. P., & Tampubolon, S. P. H. (2023). Komplikasi Demokrasi Dalam Sistem Pemilu Dan Partai Politik Di Indonesia. *Lentera Pancasila: Jurnal Riset Hukum & Pancasila*, 2(1), 1–11.
- Mawazi, A. R. (2017). Dinamika Partai Politik dalam Sistem Presidensial di Indonesia. *Right: Jurnal Agama Dan Hak Azazi Manusia*, 6(2).
- Mayrudin, Y. M. A., Nurrohman, B., & Maharani, R. (2022). Diskursus Kedaulatan Pangan pada Organisasi Partai-Partai Politik di Indonesia. *Jurnal Polinter: Kajian Politik dan Hubungan Internasional*, 7(2), 84–100.
- Moh, M. M. (1993). *Demokrasi dan Konstitusi di Indonesia: Studi tentang Interaksi Politik*
- Copyright @ Firstnandiar Glica Aini Suniaprily, Muhammad Aziz Zaelani, Yulian Dwi Nurwanti, Adhy Nugraha

- dan Kehidupan Ketatanegaraan*. Liberty.
- Rais, M. A. (1986). *Demokrasi dan Proses Politik, Lembaga Penelitian, Pendidikan, dan Penerangan Ekonomi dan Sosial*.
- Ristyawati, A. (2019). Penguatan Partai Politik Sebagai Salah Satu Bentuk Pengadministrasian Dan Pelembagaan Sistem Demokrasi. *Administrative Law and Governance Journal*, 2(4), 710–120.
- Saleh, Z. A. (2018). Demokrasi dan partai politik. *Jurnal Legislasi Indonesia*, 5(1), 56–80.
- Sugiharto, I. (2021). *Politik Uang Dan Permasalahan Penegakan Hukumnya*. Penerbit Nem.
- Sugiono, M., & Mas'udi, W. (2009). Peta Ideologi Partai Politik Peserta Pemilu 2009. *FISIP UGM 2008*.
- Surbakti, A. R., Supriyanto, D., & Santoso, T. (2008). *Perekayasaan sistem pemilu untuk pembangunan tata politik demokratis*.
- Susanto, H., & Michael, T. (2023). Akuntabilitas dan Justifikasi Peningkatan Dana Negara Terhadap Partai Politik. *Socius: Jurnal Penelitian Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial*, 1(5).
- Thaib, D. (1999). *Kedaulatan Rakyat, Negara Hukum, dan Konstitusi*. Liberty Publishing Company.
- Toloh, P. W. Y. (2023). Politik Hukum Penguatan Partai Politik Untuk Mewujudkan Produk Hukum Yang Demokratis. *JAPHTN-HAN*, 2(1), 141–168.
- Utama, A. S. (2023). Pengaturan Partai Politik Di Indonesia. *Andrew Law Journal*, 2(2), 44–52.
- Wijayanti, S. N., & Iswandi, K. (2021). Peran Organisasi Sayap Partai Politik dalam Kaderisasi Partai Politik di Indonesia. *Sasi*, 27(4), 475–491.
- Yishai, Y. (2001). Bringing society back in: Post-cartel parties in Israel. *Party Politics*, 7(6), 667–687.